

Adroddiad Cwblhau

Crynodeb o ystyriaeth y Pwyllgor Deisebau o P-03-194 Gwasanaethau bws o Gwm Rhymni I Gaerdydd

Ebrill 2009

Cyflwynwyd y ddeiseb

3 Rhagfyr 2008

Dyfarnwyd yn dderbyniadwy

11 Rhagfyr 2008

Ystyriaeth gychwynnol

13 Ionawr 2009

Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor y ddeiseb am y tro cyntaf a chytunodd i wneud y canlynol:

- Ysgrifennu at y gweithredwr yn gofyn a yw wedi ildio'i gontract ar gyfer y llwybr hwn, ac os hynny, a fyddai'n ystyried ailgyflwyno'r gwasanaeth, gan ofyn hefyd ynghylch y nifer o gontractau y mae'r gweithredwr wedi'u hildio ar gyfer llwybrau eraill yng Nghymru, a lleoliad y llwybrau hyn
- Ysgrifennu at Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn gofyn a yw'n ymwybodol o broblem ehangach yng Nghymru lle bydd gweithredwyr yn ildio contractau llwybrau bysus, gan ofyn hefyd a yw'r broblem yn waeth yng Nghaerffili
- Ysgrifennu at y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gofyn a yw'n ymwybodol o unrhyw broblem ehangach yng Nghymru lle bydd gweithredwyr yn ildio contractau, ac yw'n ymwybodol o unrhyw gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i ailgyflwyno'r llwybr penodol y cyfeirir ato yn y ddeiseb hon

(Gweler Atodiad 1 ar gyfer y darn perthnasol o'r trawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod ar 13 Ionawr 2009, Atodiad 2 ar gyfer y llythyr a anfonwyd gan y Cadeirydd at y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, ac Atodiad 4 ar gyfer y llythyr a anfonwyd at Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru)

Ystyriaeth bellach

10 Chwefror 2009

Trafododd y Pwyllgor ymatebion gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Stagecoach, a chytunodd i gyfeirio'r ddeiseb at Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili i'w hystyried yn unol â gweithdrefnau'r cyngor.

(Gweler Atodiad 1 ar gyfer y darn perthnasol o'r trawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod ar 10 Chwefror, Atodiad 2 ar gyfer yr ymateb a gafwyd gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, Atodiad 3 ar gyfer yr ymateb a gafwyd gan Stagecoach ac Atodiad 5 ar gyfer y llythyr a anfonwyd at Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili)

31 Mawrth 2009

Trafododd y Pwyllgor ymateb gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili a daeth â'i ystyriaeth o'r ddeiseb i ben gan nad oedd yn teimlo bod modd mynd â'r ddeiseb ymhellach.

(Gweler Atodiad 1 ar gyfer y darn perthnasol o'r trawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod ar 31 Mawrth 2009 ac Atodiad 5 ar gyfer yr ymateb a gafwyd gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili)

Clerc y Pwyllgor Deisebau Ebrill 2009

Trawsgrifiadau o gyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Deisebau

13 Ionawr 2009

Val Lloyd: Our next new petition this morning is P-03-194, on the Rhymney Valley to Cardiff bus service, or rather the deficiencies of the Rhymney Valley to Cardiff bus service. The petition was raised by Ms Penelope Cody and has 335 signatures. When I read her letter, I was appalled to find that people were having difficulty in getting home from work—at quite a reasonable hour, not at any extraordinary time.

Michael German: A pattern is emerging here. I notice that the letter states that this concerns Stagecoach. Around south Wales, I know of about four or six bus routes for which Stagecoach has terminated its contract because it cannot afford to run it on the current subsidy. We need to know a little more about the wider situation and whether this is also a situation where Stagecoach has terminated its contract. We need to know how many contracts Stagecoach has terminated thus far and what attitude the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport takes to this whole process. I know that one local authority is now re-tendering for the bus routes that Stagecoach has terminated, and I wonder whether Caerphilly County Borough Council, in this case, is also re-tendering for this bus route. There seems to be a wider problem with Stagecoach and its attitude towards the contracts that it was awarded some time ago, which this petition touches upon. So, this situation on the Rhymney Valley to Cardiff bus route may be due to a termination of the contract part way through.

Val Lloyd: Whatever the reason, we need to get to the bottom of it.

Andrew R.T. Davies: The Vale of Glamorgan Council went through a similar situation two years ago and subsequently this summer when Veolia handed back contracts to the council because the routes became unviable. The council then retendered for the routes and, thankfully, found alternative operators to take on the routes. From what Mike has said regarding his area, there seems to be a wider issue here of bus operators walking away from jobs. It might be worth our while to contact the Welsh Local Government Association to try to get a feel for what is going on more widely in Wales with regard to bus routes, and in particular to see whether Caerphilly County Borough Council is suffering from the same problems that the Vale of Glamorgan Council experienced. In many instances, there is not a second operator to take up the route, and there is a wider issue of public provision here. So, while the petition has raised specific issues about a set route, we are identifying a wider problem here and it is incumbent on us to try to explore to what extent this is spread across Wales.

Michael German: Just to be clear, I was referring to Torfaen County Borough Council. This petition relates to Caerphilly, but Torfaen is currently re-tendering for three or four Stagecoach routes that have been handed in.

Val Lloyd: So, those are three different examples that we know about. I have had difficulties with bus routes, but I do not think that Stagecoach was the company involved—I think that it was Veolia. I think that its quite a good way forward, both in the particular and the wider sense. We will take that forward

10 Chwefror 2009

Val Lloyd: Turning to the petition on the Rhymney Valley to Cardiff bus service, P-03-194, I think that this should go back to the local authority. However, there is an overall problem is there not with bus services?

Michael German: If I remember rightly, Stagecoach has handed in a number of its contracts for re-tendering because it says that it cannot run them. It would be interesting to know, first, whether this route was re-tendered, and, if so, whether it was let so that services continued but with a different contractor.

I have just realised that this is a commercial service. So, can this service be contracted out in the same way as other non-commercial services? That is the bit that we do not know.

Val Lloyd: If it is operated by Stagecoach on a commercial basis, it is its decision.

Michael German: It now becomes an issue for the local authority whether it wishes to issue it as a contracted service that it would subsidise.

Val Lloyd: That is why I said that we should perhaps refer this to the local authority.

Michael German: Yes, sorry, you are quite right.

Andrew R.T. Davies: The letter from, I think, the managing director of Stagecoach also highlights the double-edged sword of the improvement in the rail service, which has diminished patronage of the bus service. The rail service between Bargoed and Pontypridd has improved greatly in recent times, and that has affected the commercial viability of the bus route. I am not sure how much further this can be taken. It is a commercial route, not a contracted route. The managing director of Stagecoach highlights alternative modes of public transport in the area. I am not averse to doing what Mike said, but, ultimately, we must think about what we can actually do for the petition.

Michael German: I think that the right thing to do is to refer it to the local authority. There is an issue about running bus services alongside rail services, in competition with each other. When the rail service has been improved you must consider whether you want to run a bus service alongside it on a commercial basis. I can understand why one would not perhaps need both. As all the experts tell us, it is much better to have feeder bus services to the railway stations.

Val Lloyd: So we will refer it to the local authority. Shall we wait for a response or shall we close the petition now? There is nothing more that we can do.

Bethan Jenkins: We can send any response that we receive to the petitioners, so perhaps we should wait.

Val Lloyd: I see that we all agree.

31 Mawrth 2009

Val Lloyd: We now move to petition P-03-194, which is on the Rhymney valley bus service.

Bethan Jenkins: Shall we refer it to the council?

Val Lloyd: Yes, I think that it is like the previous one; we will have to close this petition and refer it to the council. Does everyone agree? I see that you do.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Is there a way, Chair, regarding the Rhymney bus routes—and there was another petition about Carmarthenshire bus routes—that when the petitions arrive, it is pointed out to the petitioners that as, in essence, it is a local authority issue, the remit of the Petitions Committee means that it is unable to deal with it?

Val Lloyd: The wording in the Rhymney valley bus service petition was that the petitioners 'call upon the Welsh Assembly', in relation to the reintroduction of the bus service, local transport, the local transport grants, and so on. We then have a duty to look at it. If it is a council decision, we will find that out later on. However, I do not think that we can just say that it is a council decision; we have to look at it first.

Petitions Committee

leuan Wyn Jones AM
Deputy First Minister and
Minister for Economy and Transport
Welsh Assembly Government
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA

Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay Caerdydd / Cardiff CF99 1NA

Our ref: PET-03-194

19 January 2009

Dear Ieuan

PETITION: RHYMNEY VALLEY TO CARDIFF BUS SERVICE

The Petitions Committee is considering a petition that is calling for the Welsh Assembly Government to:

"support the reintroduction of the full Bargoed to Cardiff bus service."

The petitioners are concerned that the recent decision to stop the X38 bus service at Pontypridd is causing severe problems for commuters travelling to work on time in the morning when other services from Pontypridd to Cardiff are too full or late, and leading to safety concerns for those stranded in the evening when the X38 departs without waiting for services from Cardiff to arrive.

The Committee agreed that I would write to you to ask whether you have had any involvement in the closure of the direct route; what influence you may have over the decision; and whether there is any action you can take to encourage the reintroduction of the service.

The Committee also wanted to know if you have a view on whether this is an example of a broader trend in bus operators handing in certain contracts, and if you could provide an overview of the numbers and locations of withdrawn services across Wales.

I have also enclosed a copy of a letter from the lead petitioner, which explains her concerns in more detail, for your reference.

Thank you for your consideration of this matter, and I look forward to your reply.

Yours sincerely

Val Lloyd Chair, Petitions Committee

Val Lloyd

leuan Wyn Jones AC/AM Dirprwy Brif Weinidog /Deputy First Minister



Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru Welsh Assembly Government

Eich cyf/Your ref PET-03-194 Ein cyf/Our ref DFM/00125/09

Val Lloyd AM National Assembly For Wales Cardiff Bay Cardiff CF99 1NA



0 2 February 2009

Den V.l

Thank you for your letter of 3 December enclosing a petition calling for the reinstatement of the X38 Stagecoach bus service from Bargoed through to Cardiff. I regret that passengers who now have to travel on the connecting service from Pontypridd to Cardiff have experienced the problems described in Ms Cody's letter to your Committee of 3 December.

I also regret any decision that results in a reduction in the standard of local bus services, or their frequency. In this particular case, I understand that Stagecoach concluded that from 6 October 2008 it could no longer run the through service without subsidy.

The majority of local bus services are provided commercially in response to bus companies' assessment of demand. Local authorities have powers to subsidise services that are not being operated commercially but which they deem are required to meet a social need. There are two main sources of funding for such subsidies. Local authorities may utilise their own budgets, or the Local Transport Services Grant (LTSG) that the Welsh Assembly Government has allocated to them for a number of years. LTSG helps authorities boost the number and range of subsidised bus services and community transport. The LTSG allocation to Caerphilly Borough Council in the current financial year is £500,320, within a total of £10,857,600 allocated in 2008-09. Decisions about which services to support using LTSG are for each authority take, reflecting local circumstances and needs.

I have no uncommitted funds available that would enable me to support the reinstatement of a through bus service between Bargoed and Cardiff. As John Gould of Stagecoach has advised you, the company would need over £110,000 per annum in subsidy to achieve this. I understand that Caerphilly Council has already discussed this with Stagecoach, but is unable at present to provide this level of support.

leuan Wyn Jones

Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth Minister for the Economy and Transport

> Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1NA

English Enquiry Line 0845 010 3300 Llinell Ymholiadau Cymraeg 0845 010 4400 Ffacs * Fax 029 2089 8198 PS.DeputyFirstMinister@wales.gsi.gov.uk

Petitions Committee

Operations Manager Stagecoach in South Wales 1 St David's Road Cwmbran Torfaen NP44 1PP

Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay Caerdydd / Cardiff CF99 1NA

Our ref: PET-03-194

19 January 2009

Dear Operations Manager

PETITION: RHYMNEY VALLEY TO CARDIFF BUS SERVICE

The Petitions Committee is considering a petition that is calling for the Welsh Assembly Government to:

"support the reintroduction of the full Bargoed to Cardiff bus service."

The petitioners are concerned that Stagecoach's decision to stop the X38 bus service at Pontypridd is causing severe problems for commuters travelling to work on time in the morning when other services from Pontypridd to Cardiff are too full or late, and leading to safety concerns for those stranded in the evening when the X38 departs without waiting for services from Cardiff to arrive.

The Committee agreed that I would write to you to ask for your justification in handing in this contract; whether you would reconsider the decision; and what would encourage you to reintroduce the service.

I have also enclosed a copy of a letter from the lead petitioner, which explains her concerns in more detail, for your reference.

Thank you for your consideration of this matter, and I look forward to your response.

Yours sincerely

Val Lloyd

Val Lloyd

Chair, Petitions Committee



Ms Val Lloyd Chair Petitions Committee National Assembly for Wales Cardiff Bay Cardiff CF99 1NA



i St Davids Road Cwmbran NP44 IPD 1 01633 838856 F 01633 85529 stagecoachbus.com



Your Ref: PET-03-194
Our Ref: JLG/arw WAG/VL-PC

22nd January 2009

Dear Ms Lloyd,

27 100 (b) GD7

PETITION: X38 SERVICE, RHYMMNEY VALLEY TO CARDIFF

I write in response to your letter of January 19th 2009 on the above matter.

May I firstly and respectfully point out that the X38 is and was not a contracted service. It is operated by Stagecoach on a commercial basis without subsidy and as such is wholly reliant upon the revenue provided by fare-paying and concessionary passengers for its continued existence. This has been the case from at least the mid 1980's.

As with a small number of other services operated by Stagecoach in South Wales, usage of the X38 has been in steady decline, to the extent that it has been the case for the past ten years or so that patronage has not been sufficient to cover the service's operating costs. To put this into context, prior to last October, the service averaged around 0.7 passengers carried per mile operated. The average for all services operated by Stagecoach in South Wales is 1.6. For the then timetable to become commercially viable, the number of passenger journeys would have needed to double at current prices.

The decline in patronage has been exacerbated, it has to be said, by improvements to the train services from Bargoed, particularly since the introduction of the four trains per hour timetable in March 2006 and in the worsening economic environment and with passenger numbers continuing to fall, we found ourselves no longer able to support the erstwhile level of service from within the South Wales business.

At the time we were faced with several alternatives, namely to withdraw the service entirely, to reduce the frequency of the full service to two-hourly, or to introduce a consistent hourly timetable throughout the day between Bargoed and Pontypridd. We opted for the latter, mindful that there were nine departures per hour from Pontypridd to Cardiff. May I add that we first consulted the affected local authority (Caerphilly CBC) on this issue back in September 2007 and the statutory eight weeks notice was given to the Welsh Traffic Area Office for the changes to take effect from October 6th 2008.

Finally, I regret that, particularly in the prevailing economic climate, I am not in a position to reinstate the service to its previous level. To do so would require a subsidy in excess of £110k per annum at current prices and, for Caerphilly CBC to be able to meet this extra cost, I would hazard the guess that it would be at the expense of existing subsidy for bus services elsewhere in the county.

I am sorry that I am unable to be of further assistance on this occasion, but please do not hesitate to contact me directly in the event of further or future query.

Yours sincerely.

John Gould

Managing Director

Petitions Committee



Steve Thomas
Chief Executive
Welsh Local Government Association
Local Government House
Drake Walk
Cardiff
CF10 4LG

Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay Caerdydd / Cardiff CF99 1NA

Our ref: PET-03-194

19 January 2009

Dear Mr Thomas

PETITION: RHYMNEY VALLEY TO CARDIFF BUS SERVICE

The Petitions Committee is considering a petition that is calling for the Welsh Assembly Government to:

"support the reintroduction of the full Bargoed to Cardiff bus service."

The petitioners are concerned that the decision to stop the X38 bus service at Pontypridd is causing severe problems for commuters travelling to work on time in the morning when other services from Pontypridd to Cardiff are too full or late, and leading to safety concerns for those stranded in the evening when the X38 departs without waiting for services from Cardiff to arrive.

The Committee agreed that I would write to you to ask whether the WLGA has any overview of the number and location of bus service contracts handed in by operators across Wales, and how the situation in Caerphilly compares with the rest of the country?

I have also enclosed a copy of a letter from the lead petitioner, which explains her concerns in more detail, for your reference.

Thank you for your consideration of this matter, and I look forward to your response.

Yours sincerely

Val Lloyd

Val Lloyd

Chair, Petitions Committee

Petitions Committee

Mr Stuart Rosser
Chief Executive
Caerphilly County Borough Council
Penallta House
Tredomen Park
Ystrad Mynach
Hengoed
CF82 7PG

Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay Caerdydd / Cardiff CF99 1NA

Our ref: PET-03-194

12 February 2009

Dear Mr Rosser

PETITION - BUS SERVICE BETWEEN THE RHYMNEY VALLEY AND CARDIFF

The Petitions Committee has been considering a petition calling for the restoration of the x38 direct bus service between the Rhymney Valley and Cardiff. The petition has been signed by hundreds of commuters and other travellers who have experienced extreme difficulties in travelling to and from the capital, particularly at peak commuting times.

The Committee has written to both the operator, Stagecoach, and the Welsh Assembly Government to determine the reasons for the cessation of this service. In response, Stagecoach indicated that this was not a contracted route and that the route was run on a purely commercial basis. It also stated that a substantial annual subsidy would be required for this route to be commercially viable.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport have also responded. He has stated that the decision to subsidise a route such as the x38 rests with the relevant local authority. Consequently, the Committee resolved that Caerphilly County Borough Council would be the most appropriate body to consider this petition and, therefore, it decided to refer the petition to you for consideration according to your own procedures.

The lead petitioner will be informed of this action. Should you have any queries regarding this petition, or the petitions process more generally, please contact the Committee Clerk Siân Phipps via the contact details listed below. The Committee would be interested to hear of any action you take in response to the petitioners' concerns.

Yours sincerely

Val Lloyd

Val Lloyd

Chair, Petitions Committee



Penallta House, Tredomen Park, Ystrad Mynach, Hengoed. CF82 7PG

Tŷ Penallta, Parc Tredomen, Ystrad Mynach, Hengoed. CF82 7PG

Ms Val Lloyd Chair Petitions Committee National Assembly for Wales Cardiff Bay CARDIFF CF99 1NA

Chief Executive Stuart Rosser Prif Weithredwr

Your Ref/Eich Cyf:

Our Ref/Ein Cyf:

CE/SBT

Contact/Cyslltwch å: Telephone/Ffon:

Stuart Rosser 01443 864410

E Mail/E Bost:

stuartrosser@caerphilly.gov.uk

Date/Dyddiad:

13 March 2009

Dear Ms Lloyd

PETITION - BUS SERVICE BETWEEN THE RHYMNEY VALLEY AND CARDIFF

Thank you for your letter of 12 February 2009, concerning the petition received by the Petitions Committee calling for the restoration of the direct bus service between Bargoed and Cardiff (service X38). I can also confirm that the Council has received a number of representations for the restoration of this bus service. Whilst I recognise that you are simply referring this to the Council for consideration, I have set out below the Council's position on this for information.

The X38 route to Cardiff was a wholly commercial service provided by Stagecoach that operated from Bargoed via Pengam, Penpedairheol, Gelligaer and Nelson with most journeys operating via Pontypridd. The service operated mostly every hour and required 3 buses to maintain the timetable and had been losing money for some time - the company initially approached the Council over a year before the changes were made last October to advise that the service was losing money and considered a number of options, with the worse case being the complete withdrawal of the service. As a comparison with the X4 service (Heads of the Valleys - Merthyr - Pontypridd - Cardiff), the X38 carried 39,300 passengers on each of the three buses operating the service to Cardiff - the X4 service carries on average 73,700 passengers on each of the 15 buses required to operate this route (figures from 2007/08).

The service had been affected by the improved train service from Bargoed, Pengam and Ystrad Mynach Stations - the standard pattern timetable introduced 4 trains per hour from March 2006 providing a shorter and more consistent journey time and with competitive fares meant the bus service lost a significant amount of fare paying passengers. The service also paralleled a number of other services on sections of its route and suffered reliability problems because of traffic congestion at Pontypridd and Cardiff, which has a greater impact on the reliability of this service compared with routes as there was generally only the one departure each hour.

Cont/d

Chief Executive: Stuart Rosser Prif Weithredwr: Stuart Rosser Following service changes in the Merthyr area, Stagecoach registered a revised X38 service from 6 October that offered an improved timetable between Bargoed and Pontypridd – there is now to be a consistent hourly timetable throughout the day previously there were some gaps in the timetable particularly in the afternoon. The service now operates with low floor buses, which was not the case previously.

From Pontypridd, Stagecoach provide three main routes to Cardiff - the X4 and X32 operate directly to Cardiff via the A470 with 5 combined departures each hour, the other route (the 132) provides another 4 departures each hour on a more indirect route. Stagecoach offer through tickets for travel to and from Cardiff for the X38 passengers and these are be no more expensive than the current direct fare.

The Local Transport Services Grant (LTSG) allocated to the Council from the Assembly has been in existence for a number of years and has been fully utilised by the Council during each financial year. Most of the funding received is spent directly on subsidising local bus services through long term contracts with bus operators and as the allocation from the Assembly does not rise significantly each financial year (generally it increases in line with prevailing inflation rates), there is no new money to fund the direct replacement of a significant service change such as the withdrawal of direct journeys to Cardiff on the X38 service. Stagecoach have confirmed it would cost around £100k per annum to reinstate the previous level of service and whilst the Council spends around £1.2million each year subsidising bus services (including £500k through LTSG), it would not be possible to fund the reinstatement of the former X38 route without making significant cuts to other established subsidised bus services.

Whilst I accept the comments from the Minister confirming that the decision to subsidise a route rests with the local authority, they do not acknowledge the fact that the Council is dependent on the Assembly Government for over 40 % of the revenue budget available for subsidising bus services, through the allocation of LTSG. Unless the Assembly Government plans to significantly increase the Council's allocation of LTSG for the next financial year, with funding from both budgets committed to existing contracts (and under pressure as operational costs continue to escalate), there is simply no available revenue funding to reinstate the X38 as a through route to Cardiff.

In summary, bus operators are finding it increasingly difficult to run certain longer distance services commercially - particularly where there are rail services running along part of the route, where fares, journey time and reliability tend to be competitive or in the case of the latter two much better than the bus can achieve. The X38 is one of two routes connecting the county borough with Cardiff that have been curtailed during the past six months (the other was service X16 which lost most of its passengers following the reinstatement of the Ebbw Valley train service). The cost to reinstate these types of service is high and cannot be met from our existing subsidy budgets. In the regional context, Sewta has aspirations through the Bus Prioritisation Programme to improve the operating environment for buses into major centres such as Cardiff and Pontypridd - this will allow operators to run more efficiently and compete better on journey time and reliability and will hopefully result in an improved bus network and the reinstatement/development of longer distance routes to major centres such as Cardiff.

I would clearly like this information passed on to the lead petitioner but I understand that it is not appropriate for you to release the address. I would therefore be grateful if you would forward a copy of this letter to the lead petitioner.

Yours sincerely

STUART ROSSER CHIEF EXECUTIVE