

## **Atebion i Gwestiynau Ysgrifenedig y Cynulliad i'w hateb ar 28 Mai 2012**

### **Answers to the Written Assembly Questions for answer on 28 May 2012**

*Cyhoeddir atebion yn yr iaith y'u darparwyd, gyda chyfieithiad Saesneg o atebion yn y Gymraeg.  
Answers are published in the language in which they are provided, with a translation into English of responses provided in Welsh.*

[R] *yn nodi bod yr Aelod wedi datgan buddiant/signifies that the Member has declared an interest.*

[W] *yn nodi bod y cwestiwn wedi'i gyflwyno yn Gymraeg/signifies that the question was tabled in Welsh.*

### **Cynnwys**

### **Contents**

- 2 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau  
Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills
- 2 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ  
Questions to the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House
- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 5 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau  
Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Communities
- 6 Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad  
Questions to the Assembly Commission

***Gofyn i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau***  
***To ask the Minister for Education and Skills***

**Angela Burns (Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro):** Beth yw ymateb y Gweinidog i'r ffaith bod canran y ceisiadau llwyddiannus i wneud gradd ym Mhrifysgol Rhydychen gan fyfyrwyr sy'n hano o Gymru i ddechrau yn 2011 yn is nag unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. (WAQ60374)

**Angela Burns (Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire):** What is the Minister's response to the fact that the percentage of successful undergraduate applications to Oxford University from Welsh domiciled students for entry in 2011 was the lowest of any part of the UK. (WAQ60374)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 28 Mai 2012***  
***Answer received for publication on 28 May 2012***

**The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews):** All UK higher education institutions are autonomous bodies with responsibility for their own academic and administrative affairs, including their admissions processes. The Welsh Government has no power to intervene in higher education admissions, however, it is important that we ensure that our young people are realising their potential and achieving the qualifications that they need to apply to universities of their choice. I have made it clear that I want to see standards and performance in schools in Wales improve across the board and I have already put in place measures to address underperformance.

The Welsh Government takes seriously its responsibility to Welsh-domiciled students, and we will be preserving the principle that the state should subsidise higher education and maintain opportunities for all. Also central to the Welsh Government's policy is the principle that access to higher education should be on the basis of the individual's potential to benefit, and not on the basis of what they can afford to pay. In Wales we are leading the way in providing support to students to ensure that funding is not a barrier to accessing higher education no matter where students choose to study, in Wales or elsewhere in the UK.

***Gofyn i'r Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Ty***  
***To ask the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House***

**Mohammad Asghar (Dwyrain De Cymru):** Yn dilyn ei hateb i WAQ60100, a wnaiff y Gweinidog roi dadansoddiad o natur y digwyddiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r £823,000 o wariant ar arlwyo a lletygarwch yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2011/2012. (WAQ60366)

**Mohammad Asghar (South Wales East):** Further to her answer to WAQ60100, will the Minister provide a breakdown of the nature of events and occasions associated with the £823,000 of expenditure on catering and hospitality for the 2011/2012 financial year. (WAQ60366)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 31 Mai 2012***  
***Answer received for publication on 31 May 2012***

**The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt):** The £823k incurred in 2011/12 on catering and hospitality includes:

- £14,706 on corporate hospitality;
- £4,497 on other hospitality;
- £803,401 on catering; and
- £1,048 on internal meetings

The expenditure incurred on catering includes the costs of providing the catering contract for the Welsh Government estate.

**Mohammad Asghar (Dwyrain De Cymru):** Yn dilyn ei hateb i WAQ60100, a wnaiff y Gweinidog roi ffigurau am wariant Llywodraeth Cymru ar arlwyo a lletygarwch ar gyfer pob un o'r pum mlynedd ariannol diwethaf. (WAQ60367)

**Mohammad Asghar (South Wales East):** Further to her answer to WAQ60100, will the Minister provide figures for Welsh Government expenditure on catering and hospitality for each of the previous five financial years. (WAQ60367)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 31 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 31 May 2012*

**Jane Hutt:** The figures for catering and hospitality from 2008-09 to 2011-12 are as follows:

Financial Year	£
2008-09	920,465
2009-10	890,579
2010-11	877,590
2011-12	823,652

It is not possible to provide figures for the financial year 2007-08 without incurring disproportionate cost. The figures for the financial year 2011-12 are also subject to review by the Wales Audit Office as part of their work on the final accounts of the Welsh Government.

***Gofyn i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol***  
***To ask the Minister for Health and Social Services***

**Mohammad Asghar (Dwyrain De Cymru):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru am driniaethau homeopathig yng Nghymru ac a oes ganddi unrhyw gynlluniau i newid y safbwynt hwn yn y dyfodol agos. (WAQ60368)

**Mohammad Asghar (South Wales East):** Will the Minister set out the Welsh Government's position on homeopathic treatments in Wales and does it have any plans to change this in the near future. (WAQ60368)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 24 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 24 May 2012*

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** Whilst I am aware for some people the use of homeopathy treatments appear to be beneficial, there would need to be a strong evidence base of proven outcome and safety before such therapies could be considered for wider use.

**Darren Millar (Gorllewin Clwyd):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ei hymgyrch i recriwtio mwy o feddygon i'r GIG yng Nghymru. (WAQ60369)

**Darren Millar (Clwyd West):** Will the Minister provide an update on her drive to recruit more doctors to the NHS in Wales. (WAQ60369)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 29 Mai 2012***  
***Answer received for publication on 29 May 2012***

**Lesley Griffiths:** I launched a medical recruitment campaign on 1 February this year. This campaign is aimed at attracting doctors to Wales by giving a greater profile to the benefit of both living and working in Wales.

To date the campaign has focused on the development of a bilingual website which, for the first time, brings together relevant information for those considering training and working in Wales. This was signposted in articles within the British Medical Journal during February.

In April the First Minister and I met with a range of clinicians at Morriston Hospital to discuss their view on what they see as the benefits and barriers of working in Wales.

We continue to target recruitment fairs and other careers events where we are able to talk about the opportunities in Wales. In particular, Wales recently had a presence at an Emergency Medicine Continuous Professional Development event held in London.

Key stakeholders have also been working together to develop case studies which focus on doctors experiences of working in Wales and the benefit they themselves consider to have been important to them.

A Campaign Reference Group led by Helen Birtwhistle, Director of the Welsh NHS Confederation, has also been established to take forward the different elements of the Campaign and to consider whether additional steps need to be taken. Each Health Board has an individual whose role is to link directly with this group to ensure consistency in approach and that each organisation has an opportunity to contribute ideas.

We are holding a number of events as part of the campaign and the next one will be held on Monday 25 June in the Swalec Stadium, Cardiff to celebrate success.

**Darren Millar (Gorllewin Clwyd):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion am yr holl gostau sy'n ymwneud â chreu clinig IVF newydd yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot hyd yma. (WAQ60370)

**Darren Millar (Clwyd West):** Will the Minister detail all costs relating to the creation of a new IVF clinic in Neath Port Talbot to date. (WAQ60370)

**Darren Millar (Gorllewin Clwyd):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am greu clinig IVF newydd yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. (WAQ60371)

**Darren Millar (Clwyd West):** Will the Minister provide an update on the creation of a new IVF clinic in Neath Port Talbot. (WAQ60371)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 29 Mai 2012***  
***Answer received for publication on 29 May 2012***

**Lesley Griffiths:** The new IVF clinic at Neath Port Talbot Hospital is due to open in late autumn 2012. The capital costs of around £1.5 million for setting up and equipping the new clinic at Neath Port Talbot Hospital are being met by Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Health Board. The cost of running the single South Wales service will be approximately £2.55 million annually, and will be funded by the Health Boards via the Welsh Health Specialised Services Committee.

**Darren Millar (Gorllewin Clwyd):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion am yr holl drafodaethau y mae hi neu ei staff wedi'u cael gyda Byrddau Iechyd ynglyn â chyllid yn y chwe mis diwethaf. (WAQ60372)

**Darren Millar (Clwyd West):** Will the Minister detail all talks either she or her staff have had with Health Boards regarding finances in the last six months. (WAQ60372)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 29 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 29 May 2012*

**Lesley Griffiths:** I meet regularly with NHS Chairs and finance is one of the topics for discussion. I have also had 4 meetings in the last six months with the Chief Executives of the Health Boards to discuss financial issues and priorities. My officials meet NHS Chief Executives and Finance Directors on a monthly basis, at which finance is discussed. As finance is an integral part of the management of the NHS, it is covered on the many occasions when my officials interact with senior NHS management.

*Gofyn i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau*  
*To ask the Minister for Local Government and Communities*

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU am bosibilrwydd datganoli pwerau er mwyn rheoleiddio cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar ffyrdd yng Nghymru. (WAQ60363)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government over the potential devolution of powers to regulate speed limits on roads in Wales. (WAQ60363)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 24 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 24 May 2012*

**The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant):** I have not held any discussions with the UK Government about the devolution of powers in relation to speed limits. Based on existing arrangements, I have no immediate plans to seek these powers. As the highway authority for the trunk road network we are responsible for setting speed limits we consider appropriate, within the boundaries of current legislation and guidance.

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU am y posibilrwydd y gallai Cymru 'eithrio' o unrhyw newid yn y dyfodol i'r cyfyngiad cyflymder ar draffyrdd. (WAQ60364)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government over the possibility of Wales 'opting out' of any future change in the speed limit on motorways. (WAQ60364)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 28 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 28 May 2012*

**Carl Sargeant:** I have not had any conversations with the UK Government about 'opting out' of changes in the motorway speed limit. I want to see the Department for Transport's consultation document before deciding whether proposed changes are right for Wales. Officials are examining the existing standards of the motorway network and its suitability for a potential change in speed limit. Safety implications are being carefully considered as part of this exercise. If this change is introduced, as the highway authority for the motorway network the Welsh Government can choose whether this is appropriate for our roads.

***Gofyn i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad  
To ask the Assembly Commission***

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** Ac eithrio swyddfeydd Aelodau Cynulliad, a wnaiff y Comisiwn roi ffigurau, wedi'u dadansoddi fesul gradd, ar gyfer a) cyfanswm nifer y staff a gyflogir gan y Comisiwn; b) nifer yr aelodau staff a gaiff eu pennu fel rheolwyr; ac c) nifer yr aelodau staff na chânt eu pennu fel rheolwyr, gan roi ffigurau ar gyfer pob un o'r pedair blynedd ariannol diwethaf. (WAQ60358)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** Excluding the offices of Assembly Members, will the Commission provide figures, broken down by grade, for a) the total number of staff employed by the Commission, b) the number of staff members classified as managers, c) the number of staff members not classified as managers, with figures for each of the last 4 financial years. (WAQ60358)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 25 Mai 2012  
Answer received for publication on 25 May 2012***

**Assembly Commissioner (Peter Black):** The following table gives details of Assembly staff numbers at the start of each of the last 4 financial years

Staff as at:	TEAM	M-3	M-2	M-1	E-2	E-1	S-2	S-1	Other	Total
01/04/2009	132	48	91	45	28	10	3	1	2	360
01/04/2010	126	63	93	49	31	11	3	1	2	379
01/04/2011	105	53	88	46	33	11	3	1	2	342
01/04/2012	106	57	95	48	36	10	3	1	1	357

All staff other than those in the Team grade have responsibility for either supervising other staff or managing resources or a combination of these. The staff in offices of Assembly Members are not employed by the Commission.

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** A wnaiff y Comisiwn roi dadansoddiad o nifer yr aelodau staff y mae'n eu cyflogi rhwng lefelau rheoli gradd 7 a gradd 3 (neu'r graddfeydd cyfatebol) ar gyfer pob un o'r pedair blynedd ariannol diwethaf. (WAQ60359)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** Will the Commission provide a breakdown of the number of staff members it employs between the managerial levels of grade 7 and grade 3 (or equivalent banding) for the last four financial years. (WAQ60359)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 25 Mai 2012  
Answer received for publication on 25 May 2012***

**Peter Black:** Please see the following table giving details of staff numbers between the managerial levels of equivalent banding to grade 7 and grade 3 at the start of each of the last 4 financial years:

Staff as at:	E-2	E-1	S-2	Total
01/04/2009	28	10	3	41
01/04/2010	31	11	3	45
01/04/2011	33	11	3	47
01/04/2012	36	10	3	49

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** Faint yw cost flynyddol cyflogi staff Comisiwn y Cynulliad ar fandiau rheoli rhwng gradd 7 a gradd 3 (neu'r graddfeydd cyfatebol) ar gyfer pob un o'r pedair blynedd ariannol diwethaf. (WAQ60360)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** What is the annual cost of employing Assembly Commission staff at managerial bands between grade 7 and grade 3 (or equivalent banding) for the last four financial years. (WAQ60360)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 25 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 25 May 2012*

**Peter Black:** The Commission pay and grading structure differs from the Civil Service, particularly at director level. To allow a meaningful comparison the information provided relates to Grades 6 and 7 equivalents in the Commission scale. Details of director salary costs are provided in WAQ60361.

The annual costs, including the employer's costs for National Insurance Contributions and Pensions Contributions, for the last 4 financial years are:

2008-09	£2,202,921.81
2009-10	£2,534,157.69
2010-11	£2,969,063.11
2011-12	£3,207,895.62

This represents broadly 23% of the overall salary budget.

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** Faint yw cost flynyddol cyflogi staff Comisiwn y Cynulliad a bennir fel gradd 3 ac uwch, gan roi ffigurau ar gyfer y pedair blynedd ariannol diwethaf. (WAQ60361)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** What is the annual cost of employing Assembly Commission staff classed as grade 3 and above, giving figures for each of the last four financial years. (WAQ60361)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 25 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 25 May 2012*

**Peter Black:** Commission staff have a different pay scale to the Civil Service and the information provided relates to the Chief Executive and Directors under the Commission scale.

The annual costs, including the employer's costs for National Insurance Contributions and Pensions Contributions, for the last 4 financial years are:

2008-09	£621,619.80
2009-10	£641,862.79
2010-11	£630,571.52
2011-12	£624,848.31

The salary and pension entitlement of the Chief Executive and Directors are disclosed annually in the Commission's Annual report and Accounts.

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** A wnaiff y Comisiwn roi manylion unrhyw drafodaethau a gynhaliwyd am y posibilrwydd o adnewyddu adeilad Ty Hywel, ac yn benodol y brif fynedfa neu'r cyntedd, ers dechrau'r Pedwerydd Cynulliad ac, os yw'n berthnasol, unrhyw argymhellion a ddeilliodd o drafodaethau o'r fath. (WAQ60362)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** Will the Commission provide details of any discussions held on the potential refurbishment of the Ty Hywel building, and in particular its main entrance or foyer, since the start of the Fourth Assembly and, if applicable, any recommendations arising from such discussions. (WAQ60362)

*Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 25 Mai 2012*  
*Answer received for publication on 25 May 2012*

**Peter Black:** The Assembly Commission aims to effectively maintain and improve its buildings and facilities for Members and public visitors to ensure they support Assembly business in the most appropriate, effective and efficient way. The Commission also has full repairing and insuring obligations as part of its long term lease interest for Ty Hywel. Accordingly, the Commission proactively reviews its operations at regular intervals and considers any needs and requirements for potential improvements and any refurbishments to facilities within Ty Hywel.

It has been recognised for some time that the current layout and arrangements for the Ty Hywel entrance and reception are far from ideal in relation to the respective positioning of the reception desk and security scanning facilities, nor do they make best use of the available space. The current arrangements do not provide an effective welcoming environment for the 40,000 visitors per annum to Ty Hywel or one which informs and educates visitors about the work of the Assembly. These issues have been raised by new Assembly Members in their discussions with the Presiding Officer. Staff working in these areas have experienced uncomfortable working temperatures due to loss of heat as a result of the height of the atrium and cold air blowing into the building from the frequent usage of the disabled double door entrance. The growing demand for meetings and events space within the Assembly estate has prompted consideration of adapting the area behind reception, to improve the facilities the Assembly can offer.

To address these issues, Assembly staff have discussed the feasibility of adaptations to the Ty Hywel reception and entrance. Initial concept designs are being reviewed by staff to assess their operational benefits. These discussions and considerations are on-going and no recommendations have been made or decisions taken by the Assembly Commission.

As with all other investment and improvement projects implemented by the Assembly, this potential project would be subject to an investment decision process which would consider:

- A business case
- Effective alignment of the project to the Commission's strategic objectives
- Consideration of service interdependencies
- Robust challenge and assessment of the project proposals
- Detailed cost estimates
- Competitive tendering and procurement processes to ensure quality solutions and value for money

The cost of any adaptations would be met from existing budgets set aside for investment in Assembly services and facilities.

**Andrew RT Davies (Canol De Cymru):** Faint o arian sydd wedi'i wario ar ymweliadau staff Comisiwn y Cynulliad ag a) swau b) traciau rasio c) canolfannau gwyliau d) aliau bowllo e) bariâu, lolfeydd, tafarndai neu ddisgos ac f) parciau thema ym mhob un o'r tair blynedd diwethaf. (WAQ60365)

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** How much has been spent on Assembly Commission staff visits to a) zoos b) racing tracks c) holiday resorts d) bowling alleys e) bars, lounges, taverns or discos and f) theme parks in each of the previous three years. (WAQ60365)

***Derbyniwyd ateb i'w gyhoeddi ar 25 Mai 2012***  
***Answer received for publication on 25 May 2012***

**Peter Black:** The Assembly Commission has not spent anything on staff visits to a) zoos b) racing tracks c) holiday resorts d) bowling alleys e) bars, lounges, taverns or discos and f) theme parks in any of the previous three years.